



**ARCHDIOCESAN
PASTORAL COUNCIL
in the
Archdiocese of
St. Paul and Minneapolis:
A Recommendation for Re-establishment**

COUNCIL OF THE BAPTIZED
SERVING CATHOLICS IN THE ARCHDIOCESE OF ST. PAUL/MINNEAPOLIS



About the Council of the Baptized

The Council of the Baptized is a twenty-one member panel of Catholics, chartered in January, 2012, to be a collegial voice for a growing community of Catholics in the Archdiocese of St. Paul and Minneapolis who are concerned for the mission of the Church.

Catholic Coalition for Church Reform (CCCR), initiator of the Council charter, having listened to Catholics since its incorporation in 2009, recognized a need for a representative body to hear the people's concerns of conscience. The Council's role is to deliberate on concerns brought to it by the people and to speak to those concerns, fully grounded in scripture, the tradition of the Church, and in its official teaching in the documents of the Second Vatican Council.

The Council of the Baptized is not an agent or official entity of the Archdiocese of Saint Paul and Minneapolis.

For further history, to read the charter and job descriptions of the Council of the Baptized, and to find names of current members, go to www.councilofthebaptized.org.

Contact us at info@councilofthebaptized.org or (612) 379-1043.

The Proposal for an Archdiocesan Pastoral Council

A major concern expressed at CCCR's Synod of the Baptized 2011 was that we have no channel for communication among parishes or with the official leadership of the Archdiocese. People proposed that the Council of the Baptized recommend to the Archdiocese the re-establishment of an Archdiocesan Pastoral Council with some structural guarantees for its sustainability. The Council unanimously approved this position paper on September 11, 2012.

The recommendation for reestablishing an Archdiocesan Pastoral Council along with a copy of this position paper was delivered to the Archbishop of St. Paul and Minneapolis on January 17, 2013, the first anniversary of the convening of the Council of the Baptized. Reports of the Archdiocesan response will be posted at www.councilofthebaptized.org.

Authors: James W. Moudry, William Brazil, Paula Ruddy, David Jasper, Mary Sutherland, Donald Conroy

See inside back cover for information on submitting a proposal to the Council of the Baptized.

ARCHDIOCESAN PASTORAL COUNCIL IN THE ARCHDIOCESE OF ST. PAUL AND MINNEAPOLIS: A RECOMMENDATION FOR RE-ESTABLISHMENT



The Council of the Baptized of the Archdiocese of St. Paul and Minneapolis calls upon the Archdiocesan leadership to re-establish an Archdiocesan Pastoral Council, a collegial association of laity, clergy and hierarchy, to facilitate communication among all baptized Catholics and to consult in pastoral planning in service of the mission of the Church. In recommending the re-establishment of an Archdiocesan Pastoral Council, we include specific structural elements, such as elected membership, open agenda and open meetings to ensure the Council's sustainability.

Introduction: The People's Concern

We, the Council of the Baptized, recognize that within the diocesan structure the responsibilities of the bishop, the clergy, and the laity are distinct. The role of the bishop of the diocese carries with it the ultimate responsibility in the decision-making for the local church. At the same time Catholic traditions of governance such as synods and the Second Vatican Council in its Constitution on Divine Revelation (*Dei Verbum*, 1965) encourage listening to the Holy Spirit speaking in all of the baptized (DV 8). A diocesan pastoral council offers one structure through which the people of God, their bishops, priests, deacons, theologians, and religious can listen to one another in pursuit of continuing Jesus' mission in this archdiocese. An Archdiocesan Pastoral Council offers a familiar organizational structure that elected membership can make vital and sustainable.

Supporting arguments

To support this recommendation we turn to:

- Scripture and the practice of the early church
- Documents of Vatican II and subsequent papal documents
- Code of Canon Law 1983

- Contemporary best management practices
- Precedent of an Archdiocesan Pastoral Council in the Archdiocese of St. Paul and Minneapolis and evident current need

SUPPORT FOR THIS RECOMMENDATION IN SCRIPTURE AND THE PRACTICE OF THE EARLY CHURCH

Jesus did not set up an organization with offices and ministries, with bishops and diocesan pastoral councils. The New Testament does not provide us with a flow chart for organizational decision-making (Cardman, 2002, p. 35). We cannot, therefore, claim that the Archdiocese must have an advisory council designed to our specifications to be true to the early church. We can, however, point to two grounding ideas in the New Testament for consulting the Archdiocesan community in setting up current structures of governance within the Church. One is the model of leadership Jesus practiced, and the other is the outpouring of the Holy Spirit on communities of faith at Pentecost.

Servant leadership

Jesus himself modeled servant leadership. When James and John seek to be at Jesus' right and left in his kingdom and their ambitions anger the other disciples, Jesus calls them together and teaches, "You know that among the pagans their so-called rulers lord it over them, and their great ones make their power felt. This is not to happen among you. Rather whoever wishes to be great among you will be your servant" (Mark 10:40-43; also, Mark 9:35; Matthew 20:28).

The Holy Spirit Operative in the Community As a Whole

The Holy Spirit was not sent only to a designated group of leaders. In Acts 2, the apostles as well as other men and women in Jesus' community, including his mother, were gathered in the upper room. Other communities from all over Palestine were gathered in Jerusalem for the feast. Multitudes experienced the outpouring of the Holy Spirit, and Luke reports that 3000 were baptized that day, and took up the mission of Jesus.

In Acts 15, when the dispute about the necessity for Gentiles to obey the laws of circumcision arose, the leaders brought the matter for discussion to the gathered communities at Jerusalem and finally to the first

Council at Antioch. Peter is reported in his speech to argue that the Gentiles too had been given the Holy Spirit. "In fact, God, who can read everyone's heart, showed his approval of them by giving them the Holy Spirit just as he had to us" (Acts 15:9). We take from these texts that the first church leaders honored the contributions to decision-making of the whole faith community as participants in the gifts of the Holy Spirit.

We can also point to the source of authority for governance recognized in the self-understanding of the early church. The bishops of the early church were authorized by the Spirit when the community chose them and the elders ordained them. Paul urges Timothy to remain faithful to his ministry as bishop, the gift given to him in the laying on of hands by the elders through whom the Spirit calls him (I Timothy 4:14). We can say that a twenty-first century bishop following the model of authority in the early church would consult with his people through whom the Spirit speaks.

From an historical and sociological point of view, as theologian Roger Haight explains, the early church that was formed in the first two centuries developed, as movements do, from a more charismatic authority structure to a more rationalized system. The Christian communities grew and developed governance structures borrowing from their encounters with the diverse, larger political communities in which they lived. "Insofar as the New Testament is a canonical or normative document, it teaches pluralism in church polity" (Haight, 2004, p. 106).

Currently, borrowing from contemporary governing forms, the Archdiocese can adopt the model scholars have called participatory hierarchy. Participatory hierarchy is distinguished from command hierarchy. Command hierarchy, appropriate for some uses, exercises control from the top down and is centralized. The prime virtue is obedience. In participatory hierarchy there is collaboration of equals, with a hierarchy of subsidiary roles. Here the prime virtue is learning and participation in mission (Nichols, 1997. pp. 7-10. See also Russett, 2004, p. 200, quoting John Rawls in advocating "decent consultation hierarchy" for church governance). We believe that a diocesan pastoral council can model participatory hierarchy.

SUPPORT FOR THIS RECOMMENDATION IN THE DOCUMENTS OF VATICAN II AND SUBSEQUENT PAPAL DOCUMENTS

Documents of Vatican II and subsequent papal documents direct bishops to consult the laity in working for the mission of the Church.

In going back to sources in the early church, the bishops of Vatican II noted in the Dogmatic Constitution on the Church (*Lumen Gentium*, 1964) that "...the pastors know that they themselves were not meant by Christ to shoulder alone the entire saving mission of the Church toward the world but, on the contrary, they understand that it is their noble duty so to shepherd the faithful and recognize their service and charismatic gifts that all, according to their proper roles, may cooperate in this common undertaking with one heart" (LG 30).

In the Constitution on Divine Revelation (*Dei Verbum*, 1965) the same Council says, "The Tradition that comes from the Apostles makes progress in the Church, with the help of the Holy Spirit...in various ways. It comes through the contemplation and study of believers who ponder these things in their hearts (cf. Lk. 2:19 and 51). It comes from the intimate sense of spiritual realities which they experience. And it comes from the preaching of those who have received, along with their right of succession in the episcopate, the sure charism of truth" (DV 8). A pastoral council affords a way for a bishop to hear what the Holy Spirit is saying through the faithful.

The bishops of Vatican II set out the norms for church leadership in the Decree on the Pastoral Office of Bishops in the Church (*Christus Dominus*, 1965). After defining the role of the bishop and his duty to be collegial with other bishops under the leadership of the Bishop of Rome, the Council fathers in chapter III direct bishops to establish structures to assist them in their work. They say: "It is highly desirable that in every diocese a special pastoral council be established...to investigate, to consider, and to formulate practical conclusions about those things which pertain to pastoral work" (CD 27).

As recently as January, 2001, Pope John Paul II exhorted the bishops of the churches, with the help of all sectors of God's people, "confidently

to plan the stages of the journey ahead" for each diocese, i.e., to develop a detailed pastoral plan for going forward adapted to the circumstances of each community (*Novo millennio ineunte*, 2001).

Between 1965 and 2001, diocesan pastoral councils have been encouraged in nine Vatican documents (listed in Renken, 2002). In 1973, the Sacred Congregation for Clergy, the Vatican department competent in this matter, issued a letter entitled *Omnes Christifideles* entirely devoted to pastoral councils:

The pastoral council, therefore, can give the bishop great help by presenting him with proposals and suggestions; regarding missionary, catechetical, and apostolic undertakings within the diocese; concerning the promotion of doctrinal formation and the sacramental life of the faithful; concerning pastoral activities to help the priests in the various social and territorial areas of the diocese; concerning public opinion on matters pertaining to the Church as it is more likely to be fostered in the present time, etc. The pastoral council can also be extremely useful for mutual communication of experiences and for proposed undertakings of various types by which the concrete needs of the people of the diocese may become clearer to the bishop and a more opportune means of pastoral action may be suggested to him (OC 9).

The requirements of *Omnes Christifideles* for membership in councils are that the entire diocese be represented in the council and that the majority of members be lay members (OC 7).

The U.S. Catholic Bishops in *Called and Gifted for the Third Millennium*, November, 1995, have also advocated for diocesan pastoral councils. "The Code of Canon Law requires finance councils in parishes and dioceses. Furthermore, it encourages the establishment of pastoral councils both for dioceses and parishes (canons 511-514, 536-537). Because we believe that they can enrich the life of the Church, we strongly encourage efforts to establish them where they do not exist." The document further states that the various councils "are opportunities for the Church to listen to the wisdom of the laity. ... The challenge is to nurture the growth and development of these various consultative bodies."

SUPPORT FOR THIS RECOMMENDATION IN THE CODE OF CANON LAW 1983

The code of canon law, 1917, was amended in 1983 to reflect the teachings of Vatican II. Book II of the code, entitled "The People of God" contains a bill of rights for Catholics. In its opening section "The Obligations and Rights of the Christian Faithful," the Code specifies, "In accord with the knowledge, competence and preeminence which they possess, they [the Christian Faithful] have the right and even at times a duty to manifest to the sacred pastors their opinion on matters which pertain to the good of the Church, and they have a right to make their opinion known to the other Christian faithful" (canon 212:3). Building on this principle the code recognizes the correlative obligation for a bishop in leading a diocese to consult with the people in pastoral matters. To this end the code endorses the establishment of diocesan pastoral councils.

Four canons of the 1983 code (canons 511-514) provide norms for diocesan pastoral councils. They state that the council is constituted under the authority of the bishop "to investigate, consider, and propose practical conclusions about those things which pertain to the pastoral works in the diocese." Members are to be selected to reflect the entire demographic of the diocese. The council possesses only a consultative vote. The bishop alone convokes and presides over it. It belongs to him, should he so choose, to make public what has been done in the council. The identified sources for these canons are the documents of and following Vatican II, cited above. According to canon 513, these canons must be complemented by statutes in each diocese.

In short, canon law allows the bishop of a diocese to establish an Archdiocesan Pastoral Council with the structural elements we recommend.

SUPPORT FOR THIS RECOMMENDATION IN CONTEMPORARY BEST MANAGEMENT PRACTICES

In contemporary organizational management theory, participatory leadership is considered to be generally the most effective in situations involving competent adults working toward valued goals. Competent adults buy into goals when they have freedom to contribute to the plan and they receive respect for their contributions (Nichols, 1997, p. 292). If

this is true for employees on a payroll in the civic community, it is even more applicable to committed members of a faith community. Although the bishop has the ultimate responsibility for decision-making, too much authoritarian control saps the energy of adults. As evidenced in Jesus' teaching in the Gospel and in the early church's practice, participatory leadership fosters spirited commitment in the community. The term that Vatican II uses for participatory governance is collegiality. The Decree on the Pastoral Ministry of Bishops, *Christus Dominus*, requires that bishops be collegial with one another under the leadership of the Bishop of Rome, the pope. It is the same Decree in which bishops are urged to form diocesan pastoral councils to assist them in their role of pastor.

SUPPORT FOR THIS RECOMMENDATION IN THE PRECEDENT OF A DIOCESAN PASTORAL COUNCIL IN THE ARCHDIOCESE OF ST. PAUL AND MINNEAPOLIS AND IN EVIDENT CURRENT NEED

History of the Archdiocesan Pastoral Council (1967-2005)

In light of the directives of Vatican II and of plans approved at a general meeting of the American Bishops held in Chicago in April, 1967, Archbishop Leo Binz of the Archdiocese of St. Paul and Minneapolis called for the establishment of an Archdiocesan Pastoral Council. (See Clergy Bulletin Vol. VI, No. 51, November 7, 1967, appended). The Archbishop envisioned Council membership as follows: ten lay people, five diocesan priests, two priests of religious orders, three religious sisters, and one religious brother. In his Bulletin, the Archbishop said that a Pastoral Council is "a new structure in the Church which is a sign of the unity of the whole People of God and an effective method of accomplishing the mission of Christ in the modern world."

The Council actually began five years later in 1972 under the leadership of Coadjutor Archbishop Leo C. Byrne, with an organizational meeting held at the (then) College of St. Thomas in St. Paul to elect delegates to the Council. The Council met for the first time in the Fall of 1972. It continued during the tenures of Archbishop John R. Roach (1975-1995) and Archbishop Harry Flynn (1995-2008).

As it turned out, membership on the original Council consisted of two priests, two sisters, a deacon and fifteen lay persons elected one from each of the fifteen deaneries at deanery meetings. The members served three year terms. The deanery meetings produced grass roots ideas for the Council's consideration. The Council met regularly. The agenda of the meetings was set by the executive committee which the Archbishop chaired. The tenor of the meetings as described by a participant in the late 1970's and 1980's was "two-way communication." Officials from diocesan offices regularly made reports to the Council. Under Archbishop Roach there was an annual meeting of all deaneries, the "Archdiocesan Assembly", held at the College of St Thomas in St. Paul.

According to reports from participants, toward the end of the 1990s the selection process for council members deteriorated and the workings of the Council faltered. During this time, the Archdiocesan staff made the decision to reshape the Council. It was renamed "The Archbishop's Pastoral Advisory Council." Instead of elections from the parishes, pastors handpicked representatives from the four regions of the diocese and communities of color. That council did not function well and ended in the period of 2004-2005 without an official decree of termination.

Current Archdiocesan Planning Procedures (2005—2012)

A Diocesan Pastoral Council is tasked with strategic planning for the needs of the local church's mission. In the Archdiocese of St. Paul and Minneapolis that function was taken up after 2005 by the Archbishop and his staff without an on-going advisory body. In 2010 and 2011, for example, necessary archdiocesan strategic planning was initiated by Archbishop John C. Nienstedt and his staff. They appointed an ad hoc advisory task force consisting of five priests, four deacons, one sister, one brother, and four lay men and women, two of whom were school principals. The task force was appointed for the duration of the planning period.

Based on the principles of good stewardship, the goals of the planning were to allocate diminishing resources--human and financial--within the geographical areas of the archdiocese. The fact sheet, dated June 2009, on which the planning process was purportedly based showed a growing

Catholic population, increase in socio-economic and ethnic diversity, as well as dwindling financial support, Mass attendance, and participation by young people. The fact sheet cited a dwindling number of clergy available for parish service also. This first phase of planning produced parish mergers, clusters, and closings and school closings in an effort to streamline the delivery of services. The details of this strategic planning initiative are on the Archdiocesan website: <http://www.archspm.org>.

Moving Forward (2013—)

The strategic planning process has identified deep challenges to Catholic life in the archdiocese. For example, why are Mass attendance, participation of the young, and financial support of parish and diocese dwindling? And what can be done to revivify the spiritual life of the archdiocese? Why are so many Catholics dissociating themselves from the Church? Reestablishing an elected Archdiocesan Pastoral Council offers a way to engage representatives of all parts of the church's life in dialogue to address these challenges and similar questions.

CONCLUSION: STRUCTURAL ELEMENTS TO INSURE THE ONGOING COMMITMENT OF LAITY AND CLERGY IN AN ARCHDIOCESAN PASTORAL COUNCIL

The Council of the Baptized is grateful for the efforts of Archdiocesan Catholics who served on those advisory councils in earlier years. Much has been learned to build on the strengths of the former Archdiocesan Pastoral Council and to avoid its weaknesses. We submit the following list as necessary structural elements to ensure the success of a re-established Council:

- Elected membership: lay men and women, diverse as to ethnicity, geography, theologies, and sexual orientation, shall participate in open elections in parishes, deaneries, and other associations to select Council membership;
- Open agendas: all members are free to submit agenda items and receive agenda items from the Catholic faithful;
- Strategic coherence: representation from other consultative bodies must be sufficient to ensure coherence in Archdiocesan pastoral planning;
- Transparency: all Council meetings shall be open to observers.

We believe that re-establishing an Archdiocesan Pastoral Council will provide a vehicle for communication among laity, clergy, and hierarchy, necessary for the nature and mission of Church. The Council design must include the listed structural elements to ensure the commitment that participatory leadership inspires. Election of members and freedom to put forward questions and proposals for discussion will engage members in the Council's work; and the public nature of meetings will make the Council's work transparent, enabling the faithful to hold the Council members accountable to the Church's mission.

SOURCES

Dogmatic Constitution on the Church, *Lumen Gentium* (November 21, 1964)

Dogmatic Constitution on Divine Revelation, *Dei Verbum* (November 18, 1965)

Decree on the Pastoral Office of Bishops in the Church, *Christus Dominus* (October 28, 1965)

Sacred Congregation for Clergy, *Omnnes Christifideles* (January 25, 1973)
Apostolic Letter of Pope John Paul II, *Novo millennio ineunte* (January 6, 2001)

U.S. Conference of Catholic Bishops, *Called and Gifted for the Third Millennium* (November, 1995)

1983 Code of Canon Law governing Diocesan Pastoral Councils, Title III, Chapter V.

Canon 511 In every diocese and to the extent that pastoral circumstances suggest it, a pastoral council is to be constituted which under the authority of the bishop investigates, considers, and proposes practical conclusions about those things which pertain to pastoral works in the diocese.

Canon 512 §1. A pastoral council consists of members of the Christian faithful who are in full communion with the Catholic Church—clerics, members of institutes of consecrated life, and especially laity—who are designated in a manner determined by the diocesan bishop.

§2. The Christian faithful who are designated to a pastoral council are to be selected in such a way that they truly reflect the entire portion of the people of God which constitutes the diocese, with consideration given to the different areas of the diocese, social conditions and professions, and the role which they have in the apostolate whether individually or joined with others.

§3. No one except members of the Christian faithful outstanding in firm faith, good morals, and prudence is to be designated to a pastoral council.

Canon 513 §1. A pastoral council is constituted for a period of time according to the prescripts of the statutes which are issued by the bishop.

§2. When the see is vacant, a pastoral council ceases.

Canon 514 §1. A pastoral council possesses only a consultative vote. It belongs to the diocesan bishop alone to convoke it according to the needs of the apostolate and to preside over it; it also belongs to him alone to make public what has been done in the council.

§2. The pastoral council is to be convoked at least once a year.

Francine Cardman, "Myth, History, and the Beginnings of the Church" in Oakley & Russett, eds., *Governance, Accountability and the Future of the Catholic Church*, Continuum, 2004.

Roger Haight, *Christian Community in History, Historical Ecclesiology*, Vol. I, Continuum, 2004.

Terence L. Nichols, *That All May Be One: Hierarchy and Participation in the Church*, Liturgical Press, 1997

John A. Renken, "Diocesan/Eparchial Pastoral Councils: Historical Development, Canon Law and Practical Considerations, <http://www.usccb.org> (Laity, Marriage, Family Life and Youth) 2002

Bruce Russett, "Monarchy, Democracy, or 'Decent Consultation Hierarchy'?" in Oakley & Russett, eds., *Governance, Accountability and the Future of the Catholic Church*, Continuum, 2004.



CLERGY BULLETIN

ARCHDIOCESE SAINT PAUL AND MINNEAPOLIS

November 7, 1967

Volume VI, Number 51

ARCHDIOCESAN PASTORAL COUNCIL

To the Reverend Clergy, the devoted Religious and the faithful Laity of the Archdiocese of Saint Paul and Minneapolis,

I have asked Archbishop Leo Byrne to proceed with plans for the establishment of an Archdiocesan Pastoral Council. This news will be welcome news to the clergy and religious and laity of the Archdiocese interested in the full implementation of the documents of Vatican II.

The Pastoral Council was introduced at the Second Vatican Council in the Decree on the Bishops' Pastoral office in the Church. The text is as follows: "It is highly desirable that in each diocese a pastoral council be established over which the diocesan bishop himself will preside and in which specially chosen clergy, religious, and lay people will participate. The function of this council will be to investigate and to weigh matters which bear on pastoral activity, and to formulate practical conclusions regarding them."

His Holiness, Pope Paul VI, made that document effective on October 11, 1966, with his "Motu Proprio", entitled "Ecclesiae Sanctae".

Regarding the Pastoral Council, however, the Pope stated:

"It is expedient that the Bishops, especially when meeting in their Conferences, take common counsel and publish similar norms for all Dioceses in the territory".

In the United States an advisory board was appointed by the National Conference of Catholic Bishops; and that board in turn met with the leading representatives of the national lay organizations. As a result of those meetings, a sample constitution has been drawn up and beginning guidelines have been given to the various archdioceses and dioceses of our country. Those plans were approved at the general meeting of the American Bishops held in Chicago last April.

It was my intention to introduce the Pastoral Council soon afterwards; but I was prevented by ill health from doing so. I welcome the opportunity now to introduce the Pastoral Council through His Excellency, Archbishop Byrne.

Much discretion is left to Archbishop Byrne in introducing the St. Paul-Minneapolis Archdiocese Pastoral Council. Membership will be listed presently at 21. There will be 10 lay people, five diocesan priests, two

Page 2
Archdiocesan Pastoral Council

Vol. VI, No. 51

priests of religious orders, three religious sisters, and one religious brother. The beginning board will be appointed. When the necessary structures become available a more democratic process will be introduced for the selection of the Board.

Mr. Martin Work, Executive Secretary of the National Council of Catholic Men recently visited with Archbishop Byrne and myself. His advice assisted us in arriving at the decision to initiate the Archdiocesan Pastoral Council at this time.

A Pastoral Council gives the archbishop an additional opportunity to fulfill his pastoral role with the advice and the counsel of the clergy, religious and laity. It is a new structure in the Church which is a sign of the unity of the whole People of God and an effective method of accomplishing the mission of Christ in the modern world.

Archbishop Byrne has stated that he is hopeful the new Archdiocesan Pastoral Council will be in operation in the very near future. I share in that hope.

With sentiments of esteem and kindest regards, I remain

Sincerely yours in Christ,

+ LEO BINZ

Archbishop of Saint Paul and Minneapolis

Proposals to the Council

To honor our baptismal responsibility in the local church, we must act on our concerns of conscience. We can address our concerns either with programs we implement ourselves or with programs we recommend to the Archdiocese to implement. We can also research and draft position statements or papers that ground the community's thinking in the Gospel, the tradition of the Church and in the spirit of the Second Vatican Council.

Anyone may submit a proposal to the Council of the Baptized. Please submit your proposal in writing with your name and telephone number to info@councilofthebaptized.org. You may also mail them to Council of the Baptized, 20 2nd Street NE, Suite 2304, Minneapolis, MN 55413.



COUNCIL OF THE BAPTIZED
20 2ND ST NE, SUITE 2304
MINNEAPOLIS, MN 55413

